GREER CONSULTING SERVICES
Transportation Consultants

TO: Dean Soucy
Chief Engineer
Transportation Services

FROM: Max Greer
Principal

SUBJECT: Review of Rapid Transit Project Costs

DATE: April 12, 1999

Ihave reviewed documents provided to the government by management of Rapid Transit Project Office, and have discussed the project costs with the Project Director and Chief Engineer of the government. Other documents so reviewed include the Ridership Forecasting Studies made by or otherwise conducted consultants I retained with you at our meeting of November 26, 1998.

The main conclusions of the review is that the most relevant information relevant to the project costs, including ridership, ridership ramp-up, revenues, operating costs, and, specifically, the revenue losses:

- cost estimates appear to have been carried over from the Scarborough Line LRT;
- no ridership demand analysis was reported to justify the high capacity system;
- air quality and congestion benefits are misdimensioned;
- traditional commuter rail alternative for Sheppard Line was never studied; and
- rates accepted with the Toronto car manufacturer have not been secured.

Ihave attached a brief technical discussion prepared by the RTPO. Further more detailed review will be necessary to confirm or correct these findings. The working directors to whom I have talked have been very helpful and have shown a good grasp of the technical issues and the relevant facts.

To document one's thought is only Volume 95 report (see in a letter, 20 hours) but this is a large volume! Get the book!! 12-12-12

CONFIDENTIAL 10-04-12 Page 7 of 12

2.0 BACKGROUND

The Rapid Transit Project (RTP) included 23 technical studies - technical engineering & ridership studies for the Scarborough Rapid Transit (SRT) Line, the Sheppard Line, the Eglinton Line, the Jane/Lawrence Light Rail Transit (LRT) and Rapid Bus as these corridors in Greater Toronto¹. The studies were to be completed by the end of 1990 and were to provide the basis for the selection of the best transit mode for each transit corridor (bus, subway, light rail, commuter rail, or a combination of the above). Significant passenger transport benefits, which signal transit cost effectiveness, were to be realized.

The SRT did not necessarily generate ridership that did justify the relative cost-effectiveness of Metrolinx Scarborough LRT, while acknowledging implementation of rapid transit would be a major step forward in the development of the Scarborough Corridor and its regional significance. The Metro Scarborough Rapid Transit Line was the first line to be built and the highest capital cost. However, because the Bathurst/Vaughan extension had been added to the Scarborough Line, capital expenditures, ridership and revenues were also the highest.

As a result of this study and subsequent negotiations with the GTAFA in September 1985 the Government of Ontario announced that the SRT Line, the Sheppard Line, the Eglinton Line and the Jane/Lawrence Light Rail Transit Line would be built by 2001 and the Sheppard Line by 2006 and the Sheppard Line by 2006 and the Sheppard Line by 2006